

Tradition & Discovery

The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXVI I	Number 3(completes Volume XXVII)	2000–2001
Preface		2
News and Notes and Membership Information		3
Program of November 2001 Polanyi Society Annual Meeting		4
Program of Polanyi Society Loyola University Conference-June 8-10, 2001		5
Information on Electronic Discussion Group		7
Program of MPLPhA Polanyi Conference, Budapest-May 31, 2001		8
Submissions for Publication		10
“Remembering Bill Poteat”		11
	Ronald L Hall	
“On Reuniting Poetry and Science: A Memoir of Elizabeth Sewell, 1919-2001” ...		16
	David Schenck and Phil Mullins	
Notes on Contributors.		18
“Faith and Pluralism: A Response to Richard Gelwick”		19
	George R. Hunsberger	
“Jerry Gill on Polanyi, Modern and Postmodern Thought: A Review Essay”		30
	Ronald L. Hall	
Information on WWW Polanyi Resources		34
“Reply to Ron Hall’s Review”		35
	Jerry H. Gill	
Reviews		36
	William A. Dembski, <i>The Design Inference</i> and William A. Dembski, <i>Intelligent Design</i> Reviewed by John Puddefoot	
	John E. Gedo, <i>The Evolution of Psychoanalysis: Contemporary Theory and Practice</i> Reviewed by Richard Henry Schmitt	

APPRAISAL

A Journal of Constructive and Post-Critical Philosophy
and Interdisciplinary Studies

Vol. 3 No. 4 October 2001

ISSN 1358-3336

THREE PAPERS FROM THE 2001 APPRAISAL/POLANYI CONFERENCE



A Free Society: The Polanyian Defence

C. P. Goodman

Journeyman to Master

R. J. Brownhill

Macmurray and Freedom

Philip Hunt

The Doctor of Tomorrow

Konstantin R. Khrouyski

An Account of Expertise

Jason Borenstein

Nominalism and Anti-Representationalism

Giorgio Baruchello

There is no God: the Implausibility of Theism

Norman Wetherick

APPRAISAL

A Journal of Constructive and Post-Critical Philosophy and Interdisciplinary Studies

Vol. 3 No. 4 October 2001

ISSN 1358-3336

Editor and Publisher: Dr R.T. Allen
20 Ulverscroft Rd, Loughborough, LE11 3PU, England
Tel. and fax: 01509 552743; E-mail: rt.allen@ntlworld.net
<http://homepage.ntlworld.com/rt.allen>

© Copyright R.T. Allen, 2001

CONTENTS

This issue's contributors	113
Editorial	114
<i>Three Papers from the Appraisal/Polanyi Conference, March 2000</i>	
<i>C.P. Goodman</i>	
A free society: the Polanyian defence	115
<i>R. J. Brownhill</i>	
Journeyman to master: the passing on of tacit knowledge	127
<i>Philip Hunt</i>	
Macmurray and freedom	131
<i>Other articles</i>	
<i>Konstantin Khroutski</i>	
The doctor of tomorrow:	135
<i>Jason Borenstein</i>	
An account of expertise: Goodman, Polanyi and beyond	147
<i>Giorgio Baruchello</i>	
Nominalism and anti-representationalism in Hacking's <i>The Social Construction of What?</i>	151
<i>Norman Wetherick</i>	
There is no God: the implausibility of theism; a reply to Vander Elst	157
<i>Book reviews</i>	
R. Allinson: <i>A Metaphysics for the Future</i> —R.T. Allen	163
A. Dorschel: <i>Rethinking Prejudice</i> —R.T. Allen	164
D. Lamb: <i>The Search for Extraterrestrial Intelligence: A Philosophical Enquiry</i> —Lyn May	165
R. Wilton: <i>Consciousness, Free Will, and the Explanation of Human Behaviour</i> —C. P. Goodman	166
Harold Turner: <i>Frames of Mind: A Public Philosophy for Religion and Cultures</i> —Robin A. Hodgkin	166
Lee Congdon: <i>Seeing Red: Hungarian Intellectuals in Exile and the Challenge of Communism</i> —R.T. Allen	167
Conferences	168
Index to Volume 3	169

EDITORIAL

1 New format

The last two issues were rather thin because of the lack of suitable articles. But now, thanks especially to this year's conference and to our website, we have sufficient material to make up the deficit, with more to come.

March's issue also suffered from defects in printing and several copies had to be replaced, while the price for printing each copy increased. As a result, and without waiting for Volume 4 to begin, we have changed the format so that we can print and bind them ourselves (this is definitely an editorial plural!) in order to keep the cost down, ensure control of quality, and give more flexibility in the number of pages—binding with staples was not effective for more than 52 pages. (Those of you who receive the e-mail version will notice only a change in the layout of the pages.)

2 Subscriptions for Volume 4

Appraisal now completes its sixth year, third volume and twelfth regular issue. Subscriptions for Volume 4 (2002-3) are now due, except for those of you who have paid in advance. Subscribers will find individual renewal forms enclosed with this issue or will receive individual e-mail messages about their subscriptions. Subscription rates remain the same as for Volume 3.

We hope that you will all renew, and do so promptly. Those of you who are on-line, can save at least £6 per volume (and trees and my time!) by changing to the e-mail version if you have not already done so. Yes, reading anything on a computer monitor is not so easy as reading printed pages, but you can always print off any items that you require.

New subscribers are always welcome and a leaflet about *Appraisal* is also included with printed copies of this issue. Please pass it onto anyone who may be interested, and further copies are readily available.

3 Our conferences

We had a very successful *Appraisal/Polanyi* Conference at Nottingham in March, with 15 participants and 6 papers which were discussed in detail. Three of them appear in this issue, and revised versions of the others will appear in the next issue.

Next year's Conference will be at the same venue on April 5th & 6th, and with 'The Person in the 21st Century' as the special theme: see p. 168 and either the leaflet enclosed or the accompanying e-mail message. More leaflets, and posters, are available: please spread the word.

Early offers of papers will be very much appreciated, as also early receipt of fees (to help the cash flow!).

4 Other conferences and contacts

In August I attended the 6th Conference on Persons in Austria, organised by the International Forum for the Study of Persons. These are held alternately in Europe and America every two years. As a result of contacts made there, *Appraisal* will exchange issues with *The Personalist Forum* in America and *Personalism*, a new Polish journal which will appear in English. Also, in the next issue we shall publish some of the papers from the Conference and, later on, devote 'Re-Appraisals' to the American Personalists (Borden Parker Bowne, E. S. Brightman, R. T. Flewelling, Peter Bertocci, etc.) and to Dietrich von Hildebrand.

From the start, *Appraisal* has had extensive contacts with the John Macmurray Fellowship (JMF). On p. 168 of this issue you will find details of conferences to be held by the JMF, the Collingwood and British Idealism Centre, and the Society for the Promotion of the Critical Philosophy (i.e. a development of Kant's philosophy stemming from Jacob Fries), whose aims and interests overlap with *Appraisal*.

There may also be a Polanyi Seminar in Perugia (Italy) next year: details will sent on when we receive them.

Lee Congden

Seeing Red: Hungarian Intellectuals in Exile and the Challenge of Communism

DeKalb, IL., Northern Illinois U.P.; 2001; 224 pp.; \$40. ISBN 0-87580-283-4.

The author (whom I met ten years ago in Budapest at the Polanyi Centennial Conference) is Professor of History at James Madison University. In 1991 he published, *Exile and Social Thought*, which dealt with those Hungarians who went into exile in 1918, but which stopped at 1933. This new volume is both wider and narrower: wider as it continues after 1933, through the second exile of 1956, and up to the present; narrower in that focuses upon reactions to Communism and the Soviet Union, and so some who figured in the former work, such as Karl Mannheim, are omitted in this, presumably because they wrote little about Communism. There is also a secondary focus upon those who came, directly or eventually, to Britain.

The Preface concludes with a long quotation from Edmund Burke, predicting (correctly as usual) that, if Christianity is cast off, 'some uncouth, pernicious, and degrading superstition might take place of it'. Communism was the predominant superstition that sought in the 20th century to fill the nihilistic vacuum created by the demise of Christianity in Europe. (I received the review copy on September 12th, when the whole world had been reminded of another degrading superstition and fanaticism that feeds on nihilism, and draws to itself other movements without scruples.) National Socialism was another competitor in that field. As Hitler himself said, 'One cannot take away from the people the false idols of Marxism without giving them a better God' (quoted, M. Burleigh, *The Third Reich: A New History*, p.84). But the none of the Hungarian emigrés were tempted to worship at that altar. With Communism it was different, and the subjects of this book fall into three main groups:

1. those who retained faith in or allegiance to

Communism, the Soviet Union or Marx; the chief figures in this group are Gyorgy (George) Lukács, Karl Polanyi and Istvan Mészáros (left Hungary 1956, Professor of Philosophy at Sussex 1976-91);

2. those who abandoned Communism and turned against it; here the leading figures are Ártur Koestler, Imre Lakatos (who engineered the suicide of a 17-year old girl because, without anywhere to go, she was a threat to her comrades in hiding, and who, having subverted and destroyed the prestigious Eötvös College in Budapest in 1946-8, twenty years later led the academic resistance to the student radicals at the London School of Economics) and Tibor Szamuely (born in exile in the USSR, went to Hungary in 1953, left for Ghana in 1963 and came to Britain in 1964);
3. those who had always opposed Communism; this group consists of Michael Polanyi and Aurell Kolnai.

The book proceeds mostly chronologically, with an Introduction on on the new faith of Communism in the 1920's, and chapters on 'The Soviet Experiment' (1930's), 'The War Years', 'The Cultural Cold War', and 'The New Emigrés' (1956+), closing with an Epilogue on 'Beyond Anticommunism', the efforts of Koestler, Michael Polanyi and Aurel Kolnai to find a positive alternative to nihilism and the false religion of Communism.

The principal figures from the older generation—the Polanyi brothers, Koestler, Lukács, Kolnai—come and go throughout the period, and the author, by the use of thematic as well as chronological links, skilfully weaves the episodes of their stories with the adventures of the other exiles, and often a strong supporting cast of non-Hungarians with whom they co-operated or whom they opposed. Thus the author provides, *inter alia*, illuminating accounts of local fellow-travellers (e.g. Bernal, Crowther, Hogben, who advocated the Marxist planning of science which Michael Polanyi and John Baker opposed) and 'useful idiots' (e.g. the Webbs and John Macmurray), of the organisation and work of the Council for Cultural Freedom, and the general political and intellectual climate of the time. The one fault is a certain lack of information about some of the less familiar Hungarians, and of reminders about who they are when they re-appear later on. Otherwise this is rewarding study of a very significant group of diverse people during formative periods of our history, and will be of especial value to those interested in Michael Polanyi, Koestler and Kolnai.

R.T. Allen

APPRAISAL

A Journal of Post-Critical and
Constructive Philosophy
and
Interdisciplinary Studies

Editor and Publisher:

Dr R.T. Allen
20 Ulverscroft Rd
Loughborough, LE11 3PU
England

E-mail: rt.allen@ntlworld.com

Tel. & Fax : (44) (0) 1509 552743

<http://homepage.ntlworld.com/rt.allen>

Appraisal takes a special but by no means exclusive interest in the work of Michael Polanyi.

Appraisal welcome articles (3,000 to 10,000 words) and other items for publication. All enquiries and submissions to the Editor at the above address.

Please send articles on disk or as email attachments, and ask for the Style Sheet or see it on our website.

Appraisal is published twice a year, March and October, and consists of about 50 A4 pages per issue.

An electronic version, as .pdf files sent by attachments to e-mail, is available for individual subscribers only.

Subscriptions (4 issues per Volume) & Back Numbers, incl. postage, airmail overseas:

Per Vol. for Vol. 3, 2000-1, & Vol. 4, 2002-3 (4 issues per vol.)

Printed:

UK Individuals	£10
UK Institutions	£17
EUROPE Individuals	£13*
EUROPE Institutions	£20
REST OF WORLD Individuals	£15*
REST OF WORLD Institutions	£22

e-mail(worldwide) £4*

Back Issues

Printed per issue:

UK Individuals:	£3
UK Institutions	£5
EUROPE Individuals	£3.50*
EUROPE Institutions	£6
REST OF WORLD Individuals	£4*
REST OF WORLD Institutions	£7*

E-mail versions will be available later, plus a CD of all back issues.

Copies of issues of the current volume already published will be sent upon receipt of your subscription.

* UK rates in the local currency are available for Hungary and Romania. Payment in local currency available for Australia and New Zealand. Please ask for details.

Arrangements can be paid for payments in US\$ (please ask).

Otherwise all payments must be in £ Sterling. Electronic transfers are likely to be cheaper than cheques or money orders. Please ask for details.

Annual Appraisal/Polanyi Conference

We hold a Conference (Friday pm to Saturday pm) at the University of Nottingham in March or April.

Papers are published in advance and the Conference is organised as a round table to discuss them.

Authors are invited to submit revised versions of their papers for publication in *Appraisal*.

See the website for details of our next Conference.

To: Dr R.T. Allen, 20 Ulverscroft Rd, Loughborough, LE11 3PU, England:

Name: _____

Address: _____

Tel: _____ E-Mail: _____

I wish to subscribe to *Appraisal* Vol.(s) _____ printed/e-mail attachment

and Back Issues _____

I enclose a cheque/wish to pay by electronic transfer for £ _____
NB All payments in £ Sterling, please, unless otherwise arranged. Cheques payable to '**Appraisal**'.

**APPRAISAL/POLANYI
CONFERENCE 2002**

**Fri. April 5th (3 pm) to
Sat. April 6th (5 pm)**

**Hugh Stewart Hall
The University of Nottingham**

Special Theme:

**The Person in the
21st Century**

Conference Organiser:

Dr R.T. Allen

20 Ulverscroft Rd
Loughborough, LE11 3PU, England

E-mail: rt.allen@ntlworld.com

Tel. & Fax : (44) (0) 1509 552743

<http://homepage.ntlworld.com/rt.allen>

To: Dr R.T. Allen, 20 Ulverscroft Rd, Loughborough, LE11 3PU, England: **2002 Conference**

Name (s): _____
Address: _____

Tel: _____ E-Mail: _____

Full fee Sat. B&B Non-residential (state requirements) _____

I enclose a cheque/wish to pay by electronic transfer for £ _____
NB All payments in £ Sterling, please, unless otherwise arranged. Cheques payable to 'Appraisal'.

1. Papers:

The Conference is organised like a seminar, with a round-table discussion of the papers which are issued in advance.

Each session is 60 or 75 mins, with 10 mins (max.) for a brief introduction and the remainder for discussion.

Not all papers need be on the special theme.

2. Conference Fees:

Full, incl. Registration, Dinner, Bed, Breakfast, Lunch, Coffee, Tea, papers sent in advance, & VAT:

Single room: £67

Extra B. & B. £27

Non-residential rates also available; please ask, stating your requirements.

3. Location and Access:

Hugh Stewart Hall is set in the grounds of University Park, 2 miles west of the centre of Nottingham between the A52 and the A6005.

Nottingham is served by frequent trains from London (St Pancras), and connections via Birmingham, Sheffield, Manchester and Derby.

There are direct flights from Paris, Milan, Frankfurt, Brussels, Amsterdam and Copenhagen to East Midlands Airport, with a frequent bus service to Nottingham, or contact the organiser (rt.allen@ntlworld.com) to be met at

the airport.

From Birmingham airport, take the train from Birmingham International (adjacent to the airport) to Birmingham New Street from where there are frequent trains to Nottingham.

From London Heath Row, take the Underground (slow but cheap!) direct to King's Cross/St Pancras, and then the exit to St Pancras Station, from which hourly InterCity trains depart for Nottingham.

From London Gatwick, book a ticket direct to Nottingham, and take the Thameslink train to Luton, and change there for frequent trains to Nottingham.

From London Stansted, take the train to Nottingham, either direct or with a change at Peterborough.

4. Places to Visit

In the centre of Nottingham: the Castle (with art gallery), the historic 'Trip to Jerusalem' inn, the Costume Museum, and the Lace Market, with St Mary's Church.

On the other side of the A52 from University Park is the Elizabethan Wollaton Hall (now also a natural history museum) and Park.

Further afield are Sherwood Forest, historic houses, cathedrals, castles, etc.

THE LIBRARY OF
PERSONALIST
STUDIES

Published by

ALLEN CD-BOOKS
Scholarship on CD-ROM

R.T. Allen
20 Ulverscroft Road,
Loughborough,
Leics. LE11 3PU, England

www.allen-cd-books.co.uk
editor@allen-cd-books.co.uk
rt.allen@ntlworld.com

Library of Personalist Studies: Proposal Form

Name:.....
Address:.....
Academic Position:.....
E-mail:..... Tel:.....
Title of Book:
Subject/Discipline:..... No. of Words:..... .PTO